

# ***SA MERCANTILE LAW JOURNAL***

*SA Merc LJ (2023) Volume 35*

*INDEX*



juta



# SA MERCANTILE LAW JOURNAL

---

## EDITOR

DR NZUMBULULO SILAS SIPHUMA  
*LLB (NWU) LLM LLD (Stell)*

## MANAGING EDITOR

MRS ZUENÉ TALJAARD  
*LLB LLM (Pret)*

## DEPUTY EDITORS

PROF REHANA CASSIM  
*BA LLB LLM (Wits) LLD (Unisa)*  
PROF DOROTHY MMAKGWALE FARISANI  
*B Proc LLB LLM (Unisa) PhD Law (UKZN)*  
PROF TUKISHI MANAMELA  
*B Proc LLB (Unin) LLM LLD (Unisa)*

## ASSISTANT EDITORS

MR BONGANI KHUMALO  
*LLB LLM (Unisa)*  
MR RICHARD M SHAY  
*LLB LLM (Stell)*  
PROF ME MANAMELA  
*B Proc LLB (Unin) LLM LLD (Unisa)*  
PROF PALOLLO MICHAEL LEHLOENYA  
*LLM (Pret) LLD (Free State)*  
ADV MAPHUTI TUBA  
*LLB (Wits) LLM (Unisa)*  
DR VELA MADLELA  
*LLB LLM (Wits) LLD (Pret)*

---

## EDITORIAL ADVISORY BOARD

PROF J KIGGUNDU  
*University of Botswana*

THE HON FR MALAN  
*Retired Judge of Appeal, Supreme Court  
of Appeal  
Honorary Professor, University of  
Johannesburg*

THE HON KK MTHIYANE  
*Retired Deputy President, Supreme Court  
of Appeal*

THE HON D MOSENEKE  
*Retired Deputy Chief Justice, Constitutional  
Court*

THE HON BM NGOEPE  
*Tax Ombudsman*

*Retired Judge President, North Gauteng,  
South Gauteng and Limpopo High Courts*  
THE HON PM NIENABER  
*Retired Judge of Appeal, Supreme Court of  
Appeal*

THE HON CME O'REGAN  
*Retired Justice, Constitutional Court*

THE HON PE STREICHER  
*Retired Judge of Appeal, Supreme Court  
of Appeal*

THE HON R H ZULMAN  
*Retired Judge of Appeal, Supreme Court of Appeal*

## EDITORIAL PANEL

PROF JL BRINK  
*Professor extraordinarius,  
University of South Africa  
Attorney, Johannesburg*

PROF DW BUTLER  
*Professor emeritus, University of Stellenbosch*

PROF HJ DELPORT  
*Professor emeritus, Nelson Mandela  
Metropolitan University*

PROF PA DELPORT  
*Professor emeritus, University of Pretoria*

PROF CJ VISSER  
*University of South Africa*

PROF A ITZIKOWITZ  
*University of the Witwatersrand  
Attorney, Johannesburg*

PROF VA LAWACK  
*Deputy Vice-Chancellor (Academic)  
University of the Western Cape*

PROF PAK LE ROUX  
*Professor extraordinarius,  
University of South Africa  
Attorney, Johannesburg*

PROF J NEETHLING  
*Research Fellow, University of the Free State*

PROF JT PRETORIUS  
*Professor emeritus, University of South Africa*

This peer reviewed journal is approved by the Department of Higher Education for SAPSE purposes

ISSN: 1015-0099

Typeset by CBT Typesetting & Design  
Printed and bound by Digital Action



## TITLES OF ARTICLES

Digital platform workers and the conundrum of the definition of an ‘employee’ in the era of the Fourth Industrial Revolution ..... <i>Ntando Ncamane</i>	1
South Africa’s NINA debtor plight: Lessons from the Scottish consumer debt relief system post the Covid-19 pandemic ..... <i>Shammah Boterere &amp; André Boraine</i>	27
The impact of regulatory pluralism and complexity on the governance of state-owned companies in South Africa ..... <i>Tebello Thabane</i>	49
Demystifying the value-added tax effects of foreign branches in South Africa: The <i>Wenco</i> case ..... <i>Faeza Soni</i>	123
A comparative assessment of the treatment of unincorporated business entities in financial distress in South Africa ..... <i>Kudzai Mpofo &amp; Hermanus Johannes Moolman</i>	138
Hiding behind the veil: On whom does liability for discriminatory practices by recruitment agencies fall ..... <i>Davy Rammila &amp; Ernest Manamela</i>	162
Translation of transfer pricing adjustments in South Africa: A seemingly insignificant detail ..... <i>Michelle van Heerden</i>	190
South African governance legal framework for corporate disclosures and reporting: Part 2—Mandatory financial disclosure and reporting ..... <i>Werner Schoeman</i>	213
The balancing act continues: Recommendations for reform of the National Credit Act 34 of 2005 ..... <i>Bronwyn Le-Ann Batchelor</i>	241
The application of the Compensation for Occupational Injuries and Diseases Act on impairment caused by sexual harassment ..... <i>Kamalesh Newaj</i>	273
Evaluating South Africa’s maternity protection legal regime applicable to non-standard female workers’ compliance with the Maternity Protection Convention 183 of 2000 ..... <i>Mpho Mhlongo &amp; Clarence Itumeleng Tshoose</i>	298
Using market inquiries: A sharper tool for competition authorities? ..... <i>Itumeleng Lesofe &amp; Siphosethu Tetani</i>	327
Does a settlement agreement between litigants in a civil dispute terminate the jurisdiction of the court? ..... <i>R C Williams</i>	370

## TITLES OF CASE NOTES

The unfortunate dearth of judicial precedent in transfer pricing continues ..... <i>Thabo Legwaila</i>	74
Do taxpayers have to pay tax when SARS has not complied with sections 92, 95 and 96 of the Tax Administration Act? <i>Nondabula v Commissioner: SARS &amp; another</i> explained ..... <i>Moseki Maleka</i>	94
Retraction of a ‘hot-headed resignation’ caused by depression: Lessons from <i>Cairncross/Legal and Tax (Pty) Ltd</i> 2019 (2) BALR 137 (CCMA) ..... <i>Mafanywa Jeffrey Mangammbi</i>	110

Is the foreign business establishment lagging behind new business models? <i>Commissioner for the South African Revenue Service v Coronation Investment Management SA (Pty) Ltd</i> [2023] ZASCA 10 .....	Khodani Sengwane	232
A discussion of penalties for non-compliance with picketing rules: <i>Clover SA (Pty) Ltd v General Industries Workers Union of South Africa &amp; others</i> [2021] 4 BLLR 419 (LC) .....	Mashudu Monica Mulaudzi	390

## MAIN CASES DISCUSSED IN CASE NOTES

<i>Colombia vs Carbones El Tesoro S.A.</i> September 2021, Administrative Court, Case No. 22352 .....		77
<i>Commissioner for Inland Revenue v Ticktin Timbers CC</i> (1997) 59 SATC 260 (C).....		80
<i>Crookes Brothers Ltd v Commissioner for the South African Revenue Service</i> [2018] ZAGPHC 311 .....		81
<i>ABC (Pty) Ltd v Commissioner for the South African Revenue Service</i> Case No: IT 14305 .....		87
<i>The Coca Cola Company (TCCC) and Subsidiaries v The Commissioner of Internal Revenue US</i> , November 2020, US Tax Court, 155 T.C. No. 10 .....		89
<i>Canada vs AgraCity Ltd and Saskatchewan Ltd</i> August 2020, Tax Court, 2020 TCC 91 .....		89
<i>Denmark v ECCO A/S</i> , October 2020, High Court Case No. SKM2020.397.VLR .....		89
<i>Roshcon (Pty) Limited v Anchor Auto Body Builders CC &amp; others</i> (49/13) [2014] ZASCA 40; [2014] 2 All SA 654 (SCA); 2014 (4) SA 319 (SCA) .....		91
<i>South African Revenue Services v NWK Limited</i> 2011 (2) SA 67 (SCA) .....		91
<i>Du Plessis v Joubert</i> 1968 (1) SA 585 (A) .....		91
<i>Commissioner of Taxation v SNF (Australia) Pty Ltd</i> ([2011] FCAFC 74; 193 FCR 149 .....		92
<i>Nondabula V Commissioner: Sars &amp; Another</i> 2018 (3) SA 541 (ECM) .....		94
<i>Metcash Trading Ltd v Commissioner for SARS</i> 2001 (1) SA 1109 (CC) .....		96
<i>Nedbank Ltd v Pestana</i> 2009 (2) SA 189 (SCA) .....		96
<i>Minister of Health &amp; another v New Clicks SA (Pty) Ltd &amp; others</i> ( <i>Treatment Action Campaign and Innovative Medicines SA as Amici Curiae</i> ) 200 (1) BCLR 1 (CC) .....		103
<i>SANDU v Minister of Defence</i> 2007 (8) BCLR 863 (CC) .....		103
<i>S v Makwanyane</i> 1995 (3) SA 391 (CC) .....		104
<i>Everfresh Market Virginia (Pty) Ltd v Shoprite Checkers (Pty) Ltd</i> 2012 (1) SA 256 (CC) .....		105
<i>Metropolitan Health Risk Management v Majatladi</i> 2015 (36) ILJ 958 (LAC) .....		110
<i>Cairncross/Legal and Tax (Pty) Ltd</i> 2019 (2) BALR 137 (CCMA) ..		110

<i>Bakker v CCMA</i> (2018) 39 ILJ 1568 (LC) .....	112
<i>Murray v Minister of Defence</i> 2008 (3) All SA 66 (SCA) .....	112
<i>SA Rugby Players Association v SA Rugby (Pty) Ltd</i> 2008 (29) ILJ 2218 (LAC) .....	113
<i>Grootboom v National Prosecuting Authority</i> 2014 ILJ 121 (CC) ....	113
<i>Solid Doors (Pty) Ltd v Commissioner Theron</i> (2004) 25 ILJ 2337 (LAC) .....	114
<i>NUMSA obo Williams and Southern Wind Shipyard</i> (2003) 24 ILJ 1454 (BCA) .....	117
<i>Sothorn v Franks Charlesly &amp; Co</i> 1981 IRLR .....	118
<i>Sovereign House Services Ltd v Savage</i> 1989 IRLR .....	118
<i>CEPPWAWU v Glass and Aluminium</i> 2000 CC (2002) 23 ILJ 695 (LAC) .....	120
<i>Barclay v City of Glasgow District Council</i> 1983 IRLR .....	121
<i>Marks v Melbourne Health</i> 2011 FWA .....	121
<i>Commissioner for the South African Revenue Service v Coronation Investment Management SA (Pty) Ltd</i> [2023] ZASCA 10 .....	232
<i>Clover SA (Pty) Ltd v General Industries Workers Union of South Africa &amp; Others</i> [2021] 4 BLLR 419 (LC) .....	390
<i>KPMM Road and Earthworks (Pty) Ltd v AMCU</i> 2018 (39) ILJ 609 (LC) .....	391
<i>Dis-Chem Pharmacies Ltd v Malema &amp; others</i> (2019) 40 ILJ 855 (LC) .....	391
<i>SA Airways v SA Transport and Allied Workers Union &amp; others</i> (2013) 34 ILJ 2064 (LC) .....	393
<i>SATAWU v Garvas &amp; others</i> (2012) (33) ILJ 1593 (CC) .....	395
<i>Robertson Winery (Pty) Ltd v CSAAWU</i> 2017 (38) ILJ 1171 (LC) ...	397
<i>Commercial Stevedoring Agricultural and Allied Workers' Union &amp; others v Oak Valley Estates (Pty) Ltd &amp; another</i> (CCT 301/20) (2022) ZACC 7; (2022) 6 BLLR 487 (CC) .....	397
<i>National Union of Food Beverage Wine Spirits &amp; Allied Workers &amp; others v Universal Product Network (Pty) Ltd</i> (2016) 37 ILJ 476 (LC) .....	399
<i>Rustenburg Platinum Mines v MPWU</i> (2001) 22 ILJ 2035 (LC) .....	400
<i>Algoa Bus Company (Pty) Ltd v Transport Action Retail and General Workers Union &amp; others</i> (P368/13) [2015] ZALCPE 31; [2015] 9 BLLR 952 (LC); (2015) 36 ILJ 2292 (LC) .....	400
<i>Tsogo Sun Casinos (Pty) Ltd t/a Montecasino v Future of SA Workers Union &amp; others</i> (2012) 33 ILJ 998 (LC) .....	400
<i>Mangaung Local Municipality v SAMWU</i> (2005) 24 ILJ 405 .....	401
<i>Xstrata South Africa (Pty) Ltd v Association of Mineworkers and Construction Union &amp; others</i> (J1239/13) [2014] ZALCJHB .....	401
<i>Dunlop Mixing and Technical Services (Pty) Ltd &amp; others v National Union of Metalworkers of South Africa (NUMSA) obo Nganezi &amp; others</i> (D345/14) [2016] 10 BLLR 1024 (LC) .....	403
<i>Mediterranean Textile Mills (Pty) Ltd v SA Clothing &amp; TWU</i> (2012) 33 ILJ 160 (LAC) .....	404

## CONTRIBUTORS

<i>Bronwyn Le-Ann Batchelor</i> : THE BALANCING ACT CONTINUES: RECOMMENDATIONS FOR REFORM OF THE NATIONAL CREDIT ACT 34 OF 2005 .....	241
<i>Shammah Boterere &amp; André Boraine</i> : SOUTH AFRICA’S NINA DEBTOR PLIGHT: LESSONS FROM THE SCOTTISH CONSUMER DEBT RELIEF SYSTEM POST THE COVID-19 PANDEMIC .....	27
<i>Itumeleng Lesofe &amp; Siphosethu Tetani</i> : USING MARKET INQUIRIES: A SHARPER TOOL FOR COMPETITION AUTHORITIES? .....	327
<i>Mpho Mhlongo &amp; Clarence Itumeleng Tshoose</i> : EVALUATING SOUTH AFRICA’S MATERNITY PROTECTION LEGAL REGIME APPLICABLE TO NON-STANDARD FEMALE WORKERS’ COMPLIANCE WITH THE MATERNITY PROTECTION CONVENTION 183 OF 2000 .....	298
<i>Kudzai Mpfu &amp; Hermanus Johannes Moolman</i> : A COMPARATIVE ASSESSMENT OF THE TREATMENT OF UNINCORPORATED BUSINESS ENTITIES IN FINANCIAL DISTRESS IN SOUTH AFRICA .....	138
<i>Ntando Ncamane</i> : DIGITAL PLATFORM WORKERS AND THE CONUNDRUM OF THE DEFINITION OF AN ‘EMPLOYEE’ IN THE ERA OF THE FOURTH INDUSTRIAL REVOLUTION .....	1
<i>Kamalesh Newaj</i> : THE APPLICATION OF THE COMPENSATION FOR OCCUPATIONAL INJURIES AND DISEASES ACT ON IMPAIRMENT CAUSED BY SEXUAL HARASSMENT .....	273
<i>Davy Rammila &amp; Ernest Manamela</i> : HIDING BEHIND THE VEIL: ON WHOM DOES LIABILITY FOR DISCRIMINATORY PRACTICES BY RECRUITMENT AGENCIES FALL .....	162
<i>Werner Schoeman</i> : SOUTH AFRICAN GOVERNANCE LEGAL FRAMEWORK FOR CORPORATE DISCLOSURES AND REPORTING: PART 2—MANDATORY FINANCIAL DISCLOSURE AND REPORTING .....	213
<i>Faeza Soni</i> : DEMYSTIFYING THE VALUE-ADDED TAX EFFECTS OF FOREIGN BRANCHES IN SOUTH AFRICA: THE WENCO CASE .....	123
<i>Tebello Thabane</i> : THE IMPACT OF REGULATORY PLURALISM AND COMPLEXITY ON THE GOVERNANCE OF STATE- OWNED COMPANIES IN SOUTH AFRICA .....	49
<i>Michelle van Heerden</i> : TRANSLATION OF TRANSFER PRICING ADJUSTMENTS IN SOUTH AFRICA: A SEEMINGLY INSIGNIFICANT DETAIL .....	190
<i>R C Williams</i> : DOES A SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT BETWEEN LITIGANTS IN A CIVIL DISPUTE TERMINATE THE JURISDICTION OF THE COURT? .....	370



## SUBJECT INDEX

### COMPANY LAW

- THE BALANCING ACT CONTINUES: RECOMMENDATIONS  
FOR REFORM OF THE NATIONAL CREDIT ACT 34 OF 2005  
..... *Bronwyn Le-Ann Batchelor* 241
- DEMYSTIFYING THE VALUE-ADDED TAX EFFECTS OF  
FOREIGN BRANCHES IN SOUTH AFRICA: THE *WENCO*  
CASE ..... *Faeeza Soni* 123

### COMPETITION LAW

- USING MARKET INQUIRIES: A SHARPER TOOL FOR  
COMPETITION AUTHORITIES?  
..... *Itumeleng Lesofe & Siphosethu Tetani* 327

### CONSUMER LAW

- SOUTH AFRICAN GOVERNANCE LEGAL FRAMEWORK FOR  
CORPORATE DISCLOSURES AND REPORTING: PART  
2—MANDATORY FINANCIAL DISCLOSURE AND  
REPORTING ..... *Werner Schoeman* 213

### CIVIL PROCEDURE

- DOES A SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT BETWEEN LITIGANTS  
IN A CIVIL DISPUTE TERMINATE THE JURISDICTION OF  
THE COURT? ..... *R C Williams* 370

### INSOLVENCY LAW

- SOUTH AFRICA'S NINA DEBTOR PLIGHT: LESSONS FROM  
THE SCOTTISH CONSUMER DEBT RELIEF SYSTEM POST  
THE COVID-19 PANDEMIC ..... *Shammah Boterere & André  
Boraine* 27
- A COMPARATIVE ASSESSMENT OF THE TREATMENT OF  
UNINCORPORATED BUSINESS ENTITIES IN FINANCIAL  
DISTRESS IN SOUTH AFRICA  
..... *Kudzai Mpfu & Hermanus Johannes Moolman* 138

### LABOUR LAW

- DIGITAL PLATFORM WORKERS AND THE CONUNDRUM OF  
THE DEFINITION OF AN 'EMPLOYEE' IN THE ERA OF  
THE FOURTH INDUSTRIAL REVOLUTION  
..... *Ntando Ncamane* 1
- HIDING BEHIND THE VEIL: ON WHOM DOES LIABILITY  
FOR DISCRIMINATORY PRACTICES BY RECRUITMENT  
AGENCIES FALL  
..... *Davy Rammila & Ernest Manamela* 162
- THE APPLICATION OF THE COMPENSATION FOR  
OCCUPATIONAL INJURIES AND DISEASES ACT ON  
IMPAIRMENT CAUSED BY SEXUAL HARASSMENT  
..... *Kamalesh Newaj* 273

EVALUATING SOUTH AFRICA'S MATERNITY PROTECTION LEGAL REGIME APPLICABLE TO NON-STANDARD FEMALE WORKERS' COMPLIANCE WITH THE MATERNITY PROTECTION CONVENTION 183 OF 2000 .....	<i>Mpho Mhlongo &amp; Clarence Itumeleng Tshoose</i>	298
<b>TAX LAW</b>		
THE IMPACT OF REGULATORY PLURALISM AND COMPLEXITY ON THE GOVERNANCE OF STATE-OWNED COMPANIES IN SOUTH AFRICA .....	<i>Tebello Thabane</i>	49
TRANSLATION OF TRANSFER PRICING ADJUSTMENTS IN SOUTH AFRICA: A SEEMINGLY INSIGNIFICANT DETAIL .....	<i>Michelle van Heerden</i>	190